

Reviews of Books



SANTIAGO LÓPEZ MARTÍNEZ-MORÁS, MARINA MELÉNDEZ CABO Y GERARDO PÉREZ BARCALA (eds), *Identidad europea e intercambios culturales en el Camino de Santiago (Siglos XI–XV)*. Santiago de Compostela: Universidade de Santiago de Compostela. 2013. 420 pp. ISBN 978-84-15876-63-2.

El presente volumen constituye lo que, en principio, serían las actas del congreso ‘Identidade europea e intercambios culturais no Camiño de Santiago (séculos XI–XV)’, celebrado del 9 al 12 de noviembre de 2010 en Santiago de Compostela. El evento contó con especialistas de sobrado prestigio, lo que explica la alta calidad de unas contribuciones dedicadas a repasar y analizar las relaciones a nivel histórico, artístico y literario entre el Camino de Santiago y Europa desde un variado abanico de enfoques.

El primer apartado, *Historia*, reúne cuatro artículos dedicados principalmente a los siglos XIV y XV, lo cual resulta discorde en un volumen cuyo título señala su intención de abarcar el período de los siglos XI al XV. Resulta por ello especialmente acertada la aportación de Adeline Rucquoi (27–49) donde, tras la concisa revisión de diversos aspectos histórico-sociales a lo largo de esos cinco siglos, reflexiona acerca del Camino como hipotética vía integradora de una incipiente conciencia medieval europea. Por otro lado, es justo destacar cómo los trabajos de Roser Salicrú i Lluch (51–66) y César Olivera Serrano (13–26) se complementan al tratar la conexión entre las peregrinaciones a Santiago y la campaña final de Granada. En fin, *Historia* constituye una sección muy compacta, bien engarzada, y a la que sólo se le puede achacar la falta de algún artículo más centrado en los siglos XI al XIII.

No registran tales carencias diacrónicas los dos artículos de *Historia del Arte* al ocuparse de elementos tan cruciales como

son las figuras del propio apóstol (José Manuel García Iglesias, 93–107) o la concha del peregrino, analizado por Rosa Vázquez Santos (109–135), quien resuelve la compleja tarea de analizar el símbolo jacobeo por excelencia desde vertientes artísticas, literarias y folclóricas, todo ello en un tono divulgativo que no afecta a su peso científico, sirviendo como puente hacia el apartado principal de este volumen.

La sección de *Literatura*, la principal con sus catorce artículos, mantiene la altura de las precedentes. De nuevo, muchos de sus artículos se complementan entre sí, como sucede con los dedicados a las peregrinaciones y su reflejo y evolución en la literatura medieval, a cargo de José María Anguita Jaén (151–68) –en un artículo donde lo literario se combina con la lingüística–, y Elvira Fidalgo (207–223), la cual añade el mérito de enfrentarse a las *Cantigas* de Alfonso X, uno de esos referentes literarios mayúsculos sobre los que sólo las mentes más inquisitivas pueden aportar lecturas novedosas, como demuestra la autora con su habitual solvencia. Relacionado con todos ellos, pero a su vez único, queda el espléndido estudio de José Manuel Díaz de Bustamante ‘Reliquias y listas de reliquias en el entorno del *Codex Calixtinus*’ (187–206), donde se ofrece un estudio sobre la evolución y uso de las reliquias basado en el análisis pormenorizado de múltiples testimonios.

Si la calidad de los artículos está fuera de duda, no sucede lo mismo con la adecuación de algunos a la temática jacobea. Así, en el ámbito musical cabía esperar un estudio como el de Pedro Calahorra Martínez ‘El canto de los peregrinos de Santiago de Compostela’, publicado en 2003. Desgraciadamente, no es así: Antoni Rossell (369–84) ofrece un alarde de erudición sobre música medieval donde las referencias específicas al Camino brillan por su ausencia; aún más desafortunado es el enfoque de Francesc Massip en su ‘Danza y

espectáculo en los caminos de peregrinación (ss. XII–XV) (263–300) al centrarse en tradiciones de territorios catalanoparlantes sin llegar a relacionarlas con el Camino de Santiago. Por otro lado, un desajuste no temático, sino cronológico, se encuentra en ‘A cidade de Santiago de Compostela na literatura galega contemporánea’ (225–46), de Santiago Gutiérrez, quien ofrece un trabajo aquí excusable por tratar la realidad político-social gallega contemporánea y su reflejo en la literatura moderna; sirva como polo opuesto el impecable estudio de Carlos Alvar (139–49), quien repasa diversos elementos folclóricos medievales asociados al culto y peregrinaje jacobeos partiendo de textos italianos del siglo XVIII. Finalmente, resultaría también prescindible, aunque no por su calidad sino por motivos totalmente distintos, el artículo de Carlo Pulsoni ‘Memoria iacopea e riletture politiche: dal riuo lusocentrico alle radici comuni dell’Europa’ (339–67), presentado originalmente en el congreso jacobeo (2010) y ya publicado en 2012 como ‘Radici comuni dell’Europa e riletture politiche della memoria iacopea’ (*Critica del testo*, XV.2), con modificaciones irrelevantes para el planteamiento y objetivos del estudio, frente al caso de Salicrú i Lluch o Singul, quienes, partiendo de trabajos propios anteriores, desarrollan en profundidad aspectos muy determinados de los mismos, aportando interesantes novedades. Por supuesto, la responsabilidad de estas incoherencias no recae sólo en los autores sino también en los editores, quienes debieran haber advertido tales desajustes, ofreciendo las soluciones idóneas a los mismos.

Estos deslices, en cualquier caso, merecen indulgencia plenaria ante el resultado conjunto de la obra, siendo especialmente destacable el haber logrado reunir tal variedad de enfoques en un volumen con firmas tan destacadas. Me permito apuntar en ese sentido que, especialmente en el apartado de *Literatura*, habría resultado interesante romper con los criterios habituales de edición y reunir los artículos en torno a sus ejes temáticos comunes, obviando el orden alfabético de los apellidos de sus autores. Se aprecia esto especialmente en los casos del *Pseudo Turpín* y la materia carolingia, que reciben variado tratamiento gracias a Dominique Boutet (169–85), Marina Meléndez Cabo (301–320), Michela Scattolini (385–404) y Jean Claude Vallecalle (405–417), y que, de aparecer conse-

cutivamente, habrían funcionado mucho mejor al facilitar al lector relacionar sus planteamientos, aportando mayor cohesión al volumen. Sirva esta última reflexión para destacar la multiplicidad de enfoques que presenta este volumen de obligada referencia para todo aquel investigador o curioso interesado en la ruta jacobea.

ALFONSO BOIX JOVANÍ

Castellón de la Plana (España)

CHAD GASTA, *Imperial Stagings: Empire and Ideology in Transatlantic Theater of Early Modern Spain and the New World*. North Carolina Studies in the Romance Languages and Literatures. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina. 2013. 304 pp. ISBN 978-1-46960-996-6.

Edward Said’s general thoughts on imperialism as ‘not only about soldiers and cannons but also about ideas, about forms, about images and imaginings’ (*Culture and Imperialism*, 7) are exemplified in Chad M. Gasta’s *Imperial Stagings: Empire and Ideology in Transatlantic Theater of Early Modern Spain and the New World*, which thoughtfully studies four plays – *Fuenteovejuna*, *El dueño de las estrellas*, *La púrpura de la rosa* and *El divino Narciso* – and proposes that theatre was a means to not only uphold Spanish political agendas but also refine, revise and propagate them. Gasta’s study warrants a rereading of certain canonical texts and compels a reconsideration of their lesser-known counterparts in light of the era’s complex political backdrop.

As shepherding supplants horticulture as a livelihood during the seventeenth century as the consequence of a decline in transatlantic trade and the subsequent rise and profitability of wool shearing, Gasta maintains that Lope’s agrarian underplot in *Fuenteovejuna* offers a social commentary, much like the play’s traditional corrupt Comendador critique, which strives to bring to light the townspeople’s discontent with the state of their economy. Through numerous crop images that are notable but easily discountable, Gasta highlights villagers’ hunger for change. These references ironically highlight a scarcity of food on the plates of citizens, which leads to a subsequent idealization of agricultural products. In this way, Gasta’s exploration of *Fuenteovejuna*’s subtle agrarian

reform subtext enhances the play's extant political underpinnings as they relate to tangential questions of hegemony, class and nationhood.

The need for legal reform in Spain as it applied to Mexico frames *El dueño de las estrellas*, whose author, Juan Ruiz de Alarcón, as a practising lawyer on both sides of the Atlantic, figured as the ideal candidate to probe the issue. The litigious seventeenth century would have also prepared playgoers with, at the very least, a basic understanding of the law. The upshot was a general public familiarized with and sensitive to legal affairs. Alarcón fictionalizes the character of Lycurgus, the quintessential statesman previously credited for sweeping legal reform in Crete, who in the play serves as a political model (notwithstanding his suicide). As a result, Alarcón is able to problematize mishandlings by the King's 'manager' ('privado'/ 'valido') and dramatize obstacles and solutions, which would, in theory, ultimately ameliorate Spanish-Mexican relations.

Focusing on the *loa* that accompanies Calderón's *La púrpura de la rosa*, composed in honour of a peace agreement and an ensuing marriage accord, Gasta examines the political tensions between France and Spain during a time of imperial crisis for the latter. He concludes that through the events that transpire in his play, Calderón manages to express disapproval of the treaty, anticipate and demonstrate concern for audience reception, and assert his superiority as a Spanish playwright by experimenting with an embryonic operatic genre in one fell swoop.

In the auto sacramental *El divino Narciso*, according to Gasta, Sor Juana advocates for religious pluralism in order to challenge, in a move that recalls Las Casas, standard violent conquest practices. Because the play was intended to be staged in Madrid, she seizes a teaching opportunity the plot affords her to explore the commonalities between, and perhaps those that go beyond, Christianity and Aztec beliefs. The allegory of Christ as Narcissus, then, not only serves as a Counter-Reformation tool and a defence against Lutheranism but also figures as an affirmation of indigenous perspectives without compromising Christian ideology or, more importantly, authority.

In addition to their shared, imperial undertones, Gasta's individual analyses

weave a collective cautionary tale about 'playing' politics in seventeenth-century Spain. He draws attention to the subtlety and ambiguity imbuing the storylines of these works that act, perhaps, as the playwright's best defence when dealing with timely yet thorny subject matter. As a result, rather than confirm revolutionary objectives, Gasta highlights playwrights' power of suggestion to influence audience reception and artfully footnote Spanish monarchical policies.

Overall, Gasta succeeds in evincing an imperial substructure buttressing these plays that might otherwise be overlooked with a fluid, crisp and accessible writing style throughout. In terms of content, the project is engaging and insightful, with only minor deficiencies: The chapter on *Púrpura* barely scratches the surface of play's *loa* as an extension of Spain's imperial agenda while the biography of Sor Juana in the chapter on *Narciso* somewhat stalls textual enquiry. Lastly, despite negligible editing errors ('it is also serves as a self-reflexive act' (182) and 'Sor Juan' (252)), the quality of analysis remains unaffected.

In their totality, the imperial readings backed by detailed historical minutiae and overviews Gasta fleshes out help deepen and broaden our understanding of the plays' storylines and have the potential to refresh both research and teaching approaches to the *comedia*, making this book a solid and welcome addition to Early Modern Spanish transatlantic studies.

BONNIE GASIOR

[AQ1] Bellflower Blvd. University

JAN E. EVANS, *Miguel de Unamuno's Quest for Faith. A Kierkegaardian Understanding of Unamuno's Struggle to Believe*. Cambridge, UK: James Clark. 2014. 138 pp. ISBN: 978 0 227 17436 4.

Miguel de Unamuno's complex and polemical conception of faith has often been debated. Some scholars search in his personal life for reasons for his religious doubt, while others prefer to identify similarities between Unamuno and other philosophers in their thinking about faith. Jan E. Evans' study combines both; it sets off by accounting for some crucial historic events in the life of the Spanish philosopher alongside a chrono-

logical account of Unamuno's non-fictional texts dedicated to the question of faith. From this basis Evans proceeds to a comparison of Unamuno's thoughts on faith with the ideas of Pascal, Kierkegaard and William James. As the author emphasizes, her purpose is not to provide Unamuno with a religious label, but to take a fresh look at some of the most vexing problems in Unamuno's understanding of faith – a fresh look which seeks to be sympathetic though not uncritical of his religious convictions. Evans' study discusses the question of faith in a broad perspective, which comprehends the quest for immortality and the idea of truth. Thus true faith becomes the central focus.

The idea of 'lived truth' is compared to the claim that 'truth is subjectivity', voiced by Johannes Climacus, who is not to be understood, Evans insists, as an exponent of Kierkegaard's own thought. The impossibility of arriving at a rational proof of God's existence and the importance of eternal life are analysed in relation to William James, whose 'The Will to Believe' inspires Unamuno to define the *querer creer*. James' connection between will and truth inspires the 'desire to believe' which characterizes the whole of Unamuno's philosophy. The comparison to Pascal serves to demonstrate that Unamuno's idea of reason is in conflict with his quest for faith. Unamuno's idea of reason differs from that of the French thinker. Pascal has a much richer conception of reason than Unamuno, who defines reason in a positivistic way which subjects reason to the test of science. It is this definition, Evans argues, that repeatedly leads Unamuno to condemn intellectualism; it makes it impossible for him to make the leap of faith that Pascal had taken and Kierkegaard had named. Despite the framing presence of James and Pascal, it is Kierkegaard who holds the centre of this study, as the title indicates, and there are numerous insights to be gathered from the comparisons.

In the conclusion Evans returns to the person of Unamuno and links the central terms of the study – faith and truth – to his circumstances and his political stance, primarily through the lens of the 2009 biography by Jean-Claude and Collette Rabaté. The argument is made that Unamuno's quest for faith manifests itself philosophically in ways that affect Unamuno's personal life: since the truth must be lived, if he is to earn

the name of philosopher then his thinking must affect his life. Thus Unamuno's philosophical and religious project is revealed as an ultimately personal matter in spite of the abstraction of its premises and procedures.

Unamuno's literary works are almost in their totality left out of this study with the exception of a few comments on *San Manuel Bueno, mártir* and *La Oración del Ateo*. This is the only serious criticism of a very insightful analysis which sheds light on the very complex, personal and philosophical concept of faith. Unamuno's thinking is far from systematic and sometimes even contradictory, and it is no easy task to make sense of his disparate views expressed over a long life. Yet Evans makes Unamuno's general conception and not always consistent understanding of faith accessible to new readers as well as interestingly framed for more experienced ones. The relevance of Unamuno's thinking today is clearly asserted in the Foreword by Stephen T. Davis, who outlines the general trajectory of religious doubt in which Unamuno is to be inserted. This is the line followed throughout the study, with its oscillations between rational explanations and faithful consolations, doubt being always present as the moving force.

KATRINE HELENE ANDERSEN

University of Copenhagen

NICOLÁS FERNÁNDEZ-MEDINA, *The Poetics of Otherness in Antonio Machado's 'Proverbios y cantares'*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press. 2011. 214 pp. ISBN: 9780708323229.

Este libro ofrece una interesante presentación de una parcela de la poesía de Antonio Machado en el marco de la filosofía, la literatura y la historia moderna y contemporánea. El combinar la precisión del objeto con la amplitud del marco es uno de los principales méritos de este trabajo, y hace recomendable su lectura para quienquiera que se interese no solamente por Machado, su poesía y su poética, sino también por el problemático ajuste de la cultura española a la Modernidad occidental.

La introducción expone el carácter filosófico de la poesía de Antonio Machado y valora el papel de lo fragmentario, en la tradición romántica, como forma adecuada de expre-

sión. El primer capítulo está dedicado a la subjetividad moderna: los problemas de la epistemología a partir de Kant, el auge del individualismo, la tendencia a la fragmentación, y el uso literario de los proverbios y cantares. El segundo capítulo detalla la formación de Machado: su familia, estudios, e influencias poéticas y filosóficas. El tercero trata las relaciones entre el arte y la vida a través del epistolario Machado–Unamuno y la visión del Modernismo (entendido como escuela poética restringida al ‘preciosismo’ y ‘turrieburnismo’). El cuarto capítulo explica la religiosidad de Machado, su teísmo escéptico, su visión de Jesús y su crítica de la Iglesia. El quinto indaga las paradojas de conocimiento e ignorancia, en el marco de los problemas del analfabetismo y el caciquismo en España. Por último, se ofrece una síntesis y una conexión de las propuestas machadianas con la filosofía de Emmanuel Lévinas, como muestra de la relevancia actual de los ‘Proverbios y cantares’ para la comprensión de la otredad.

Este resumen deja ver que el libro, aunque breve, no es circunspecto. Uno encuentra noticias sobre la etimología de la palabra griega para ‘proverbio’, sobre la política de Maura, sobre la abuela de Machado, sobre la emigración y el éxodo rural, sobre Sócrates; y no puede decirse que la relevancia de todo ello sea evidente por igual. La conexión, ciertamente, es posible, gracias a una considerable elasticidad de la idea de ‘otredad’: abarca, sucesivamente, el tú interlocutor, el prójimo, el pueblo, Dios, ‘lo otro’ en general. A pesar de esta exuberancia, se puede echar de menos algo: por ejemplo, una discusión de las relaciones entre el ‘modernismo’ poético en sentido estricto, el modernismo teológico (aparecen en distintos capítulos (95–100 y 110–16)), el ‘Modernism’ en sentido anglosajón, y la Modernidad tardía. En cuanto a los ‘Proverbios y cantares’, se los pierde de vista durante demasiadas páginas; el enfoque es primordialmente semántico, según el tema principal de cada capítulo. El marco histórico y filosófico elegido refuerza la significación de cada poema, dejando al margen que en algún caso la interpretación de Fernández-Medina resulta menos convincente –así, no debería omitirse que ‘el ave divina’ es inmediatamente el águila, aunque también conecte con la paloma kantiana (19), porque el contraste águila/ gallina es clave en la

eficacia de la imagen–.

No es demérito de este trabajo, sino un síntoma de lo que alguien llamó ‘viriatismo metodológico’ de los estudios literarios –que los mantiene lejos del camino seguro de la ciencia–, el que no citen a Fernández-Medina libros posteriores (*España, el paisaje, el tiempo y otros temas en la poesía de Antonio Machado* de Barbagallo, 2012; *Antonio Machado en sus apócrifos* de Cerezo Galán, 2012; *La filosofía poética de Antonio Machado* de García Castro, 2013; *Los Proverbios y cantares de Antonio Machado* de García Wiedemann, 2014), alguno de los cuales habría ganado si lo hubiese tenido en cuenta. También es verdad que Fernández-Medina, aunque se basa en una bibliografía amplia, omite algunos trabajos que le habrían sido de utilidad; por ejemplo, contribuciones incluidas en *Estudios sobre Antonio Machado* (Münster, 1992) y *Antonio Machado hacia Europa* (Madrid, 1993) y los volúmenes de Lourenço, *Identidad y alteridad en Fernando Pessoa y Antonio Machado* (Salamanca, 1997) y Vila-Belda, *Antonio Machado, poeta de lo nimio* (Madrid, 2004).

En conclusión, el lector cuyo interés se ciña estrictamente a los ‘Proverbios y cantares’ de Antonio Machado quizá deba empezar por la reciente monografía y edición de García Wiedemann; pero quien tenga un interés general por la poética de Machado y por las relaciones entre la poesía, el pensamiento y la historia contemporánea encontrará en *The Poetics of Otherness* de Fernández-Medina una valiosa introducción plena de orientaciones y estímulos.

LUÍS GALVAN

Universidad de Navarra

DACIA VIEJO-ROSE, *Reconstructing Spain: Cultural Heritage and Memory after Civil War*. Brighton, UK: Sussex Academic Press. 2011. 272 pp. ISBN 9781845194352.

Olivia Muñoz-Rojas, *Ashes and Granite: Destruction and Reconstruction in the Spanish Civil War and its Aftermath*. Brighton, UK: Sussex Academic Press. 2011. 272 pp. ISBN 9781845194369.

Cultural heritage is, as Cañada Blanch Series Editor Paul Preston observes in the Preface to Dacia Viejo-Rose’s *Reconstructing Spain: Cultural Heritage and Memory after Civil War*, a ‘highly symbolic domain’ which carries immense

power as a tool to mould memory and therefore identity. In a country like Spain which is still debating the legacy of an almost 40-year dictatorship, it is in other words essential to include in this debate an analysis of the dictatorship's cultural policies. To this end, Sussex Academic Press in collaboration with the Cañada Blanch Centre has published two volumes that in many ways complement each other: *Reconstructing Spain* by Viejo-Rose and *Ashes and Granite: Destruction and Reconstruction in the Spanish Civil War and its Aftermath* by Olivia Muñoz-Rojas. Both authors pose big theoretical questions about heritage management and cultural development yet have for justifiable practical reasons decided to limit their concrete empirical analysis to a set of case studies concerning the Franco regime's reconstruction policies in the aftermath of the battlefield war of 1936–1939 in Spain.

As both books clearly show, the reconstruction of urban and rural areas partially or wholly destroyed as a result of the war gave rise to a number of issues that transcended purely material and economic concerns. Political and cultural considerations inevitably came into play; that is, considerations to do with perceived correspondences between art and architecture on the one hand and culture in a broader anthropological sense on the other. Most importantly, as the reconstruction process was in practice used by different actors to challenge, change or reaffirm regional or national identities, the significance of reconstruction was frequently (though never officially) contested. This is evident not least in the discrepancies that existed between the priorities and desires of state agencies compared to those of local communities.

To allow the reader to appreciate the multi-dimensional aspect of reconstruction discourse, Viejo-Rose includes in her book a broad overview of key conceptions which have shaped cultural conflicts in twentieth- and twenty-first-century Spain. After this overview, a more detailed case study follows, centred on the post-civil war reconstruction of the Basque town of Gernika. As was the case in towns elsewhere (e.g. Belchite and Brunete), reconstruction in Gernika did not simply result in a restoration of the built environment to its pre-war state but rather brought a series of modifications to both architecture and town layout. While in some instances these resulted from ignorance of

local tradition, the majority of modifications nation-wide stemmed from town planners' desire to conform better to the regime's architectural preferences, drawing on notions of noble 'Spanish' customs, as well as efforts to modernize the infrastructure of rural towns. The regime's authoritarian approach to reconstruction also meant that the central reconstruction agency could prove impervious to local preferences: in Gernika, the much-loved church of San Juan was never rebuilt because the architect responsible for the local reconstruction plan deemed it to have been 'lacking artistic character'.

The dynamic whereby reconstruction leads to transformation is also expertly analysed by Olivia Muñoz-Rojas in *Ashes and Granite*, although here the focus is on three large cities – Madrid, Bilbao and Barcelona – rather than rural towns like Gernika. One of the main strengths of this work is the clarity with which the author shows the gradual transformation of Francoist reconstruction policies and the gap that eventually opened up between ideologically coloured reconstruction rhetoric and pragmatic economic reality. Leading Falangists' grandiose post-war plans for a new architecture based on the neoclassical style of Philip II's imperial Spain (which found its ideal expression in El Escorial) bore little fruit, and the enormous party headquarters destined for the 'sacred' site of the destroyed Montaña barracks in Madrid never materialized.

Both books draw on a wide variety of sources and are richly illustrated with photographs, maps and other visual material that clarify and strengthen the arguments presented. In terms of theory, both authors have also adopted broad interdisciplinary perspectives which clearly indicate how these studies may inspire further comparative research. The most expansive theoretical discussions – most notably that of Viejo-Rose's sixth chapter – would perhaps have benefited from a more detailed analysis of the concepts introduced. Likewise there is a risk that the wide chronological range of Viejo-Rose's work, which offers a good account of long-term developments, may leave readers feeling that specific phenomena and debates could have been explored in greater depth. Still, there is no doubt both books make a valuable and highly original contribution to the literature on twentieth-century Spain

and the dynamics of post-war reconstruction more generally.

CARL-HENRIK BJERSTRÖM

Royal Holloway, University of London

JOSÉ JURADO MORALES, *Las razones éticas del realismo: Revista Española (1953–1954) en la literatura de medio siglo*. Sevilla: Editorial Renacimiento. 2012. 410 pp. ISBN: 978-84-8472-740-8.

El presente libro trata con detalle el año de vida de una importante revista literaria de mitad del siglo XX, *Revista Española*. La importancia de esta revista no se basa en la tirada que tuvo o el número de suscriptores y lectores con los que llegó a contar durante su corta vida, sino en el importante número de escritores de la época, en muchos casos nobeles, que pasaron por sus páginas. *Revista Española* publicó su primer número en la primavera de 1953 bajo el mecenazgo de Rodríguez-Moñino. Autores muy jóvenes en esa época, lo que Jurado Morales llama 'escritores por hacer' (401) como Carmen Martín Gaité, Ignacio Aldecoa, Josefina Rodríguez, Rafael Sánchez Ferlosio, Jesús Fernández Santos, Alfonso Sastre, Medardo Fraile, Juan Antonio Gaya Nuño o Dolores Palá Berdejo, publicaron algunos de sus primeros cuentos y artículos de crítica en esta revista. Como contaría Martín Gaité en su obra *Esperando el Porvenir: homenaje a Ignacio Aldecoa*, *Revista Española* (1994) parecía haber sido fundada especialmente para ellos.

José Jurado Morales con su libro *Las razones éticas de realismo: Revista Española (1953–1954) en la literatura del medio siglo*, quiere poner la *Revista Española* en el lugar relevante que se merece en las letras españolas del siglo XX. Este es un metódico y detallado estudio sobre la revista en el que Jurado Morales describe sus comienzos, sus contribuidores y cómo sirvió de plataforma de lanzamiento para un importante número de autores que pertenecieron a la generación de medio siglo o generación del 50.

La voz de Carmen Martín Gaité se oye a través de esta obra, habiendo sido esta escritora la que 'puso en contacto' a Jurado Morales con la revista a través de su ya mencionada obra *Esperando el Porvenir*. Siendo Jurado Morales un especialista de la obra de Martín Gaité, este libro, además de servir

para honrar la *Revista Española*, también parece estar honrando la memoria de Martín Gaité y su papel a la hora de presentar no sólo *Revista Española* sino también los sentimientos y experiencias de esos jóvenes autores.

Las razones éticas del realismo está dividido en cuatro capítulos. La primera parte del monográfico de Jurado Morales nos relata sus primeros días, sus comienzos. Este primer capítulo está lleno de información bibliográfica y anecdótica sobre los componentes de la revista. Jurado Morales escribe sobre las personas que la integraron, su carácter; con anécdotas sacadas de numerosos libros, artículos y autobiografías. El autor nos hace ver la importancia que el cuento y el teatro tuvo en la revista, comentando en la sorprendente ausencia de la poesía, también describe las diferentes secciones como las de crítica literaria, cinematográfica y de arte. Jurado Morales no sólo escribe sobre la revista y sus contribuidores sino que en el capítulo segundo hace un importante viaje a través del contexto político-cultural en el que nace *Revista Española*. Influencias tales como el neorrealismo italiano que entra a España a través de la *Primera Semana de Cine Italiano* que tuvo lugar en 1951. En esta sección el autor también nos presenta muchas otras revistas literarias de la época comparando sus intenciones y contenido al de *Revista Española*. El capítulo tres se centra en el contenido de la revista, su fuerte estética neorrealista y su relación con el realismo social de la literatura de los 50.

El cuarto capítulo, de solo trece páginas, sirve de despedida a una revista que tuvo una muy corta vida a pesar de haber tenido grandes expectativas, como dijo Martín Gaité, la *Revista Española*: 'Entra de puntillas en la vida española, como de puntillas salió' (399). Por último y como coletilla del libro, encontramos los sumarios de los seis números de la revista que nos hace ver la importancia de los autores que dejaron sus escritos en la revista y de los temas tratados en sus páginas.

Para concluir, *Las razones éticas del realismo: Revista Española (1953–1954) en la literatura de medio siglo*, es un libro fundamental para todo aquel que quiera conocer no sólo la corta historia de *Revista Española*, sino un año fundamental en la vida de un número importante de autores y pensadores de los años 50 en España.

MARIA-JOSÉ BLANCO

King's College London

DAVID ARCHIBALD, *The War that Won't Die: The Spanish Civil War in Cinema*. Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press. 2012. 245 pp. ISBN 978 6543 9876.

In this broad examination of the representation of the Spanish Civil War in film across the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, David Archibald builds his argument around questions of film form and representation posited in the works of Robert Rosenstone, Hayden White and Keith Jenkins. While Archibald explores a selection of fictional films charting the continued cinematic revisiting of the conflict by those sympathetic to the Republican cause, he establishes the wider context, cinematically and historically, into which this small sample of films belong, discussing broader questions of narrativizing history, the representation of history in film and the enormous subject of the Spanish Civil War in film.

The thematic chapters in which these films are discussed mirror major critical discourses of Spanish memory debates and of the cultural representation of the past, both in relation to cinema and beyond. Questions of external political influences in the depiction of the war, state censorship, form and mode, and the return and responsibilities of filmmakers to the past are all addressed in the analyses of the selected films. This filmic analysis is divided into nine chapters, the first four of which deal with films created before Franco's death and the latter five focusing on those produced since the dictator's death.

The first four chapters examine the representation of the Civil War from within the United States, East Germany under the then-ruling Socialist Unity Party, France, and finally Spain under the Francoist censor. Focusing principally on *For Whom the Bell Tolls* (Wood, 1943), *Five Cartridges* (Beyer, 1960), *¡Viva la muerte!* (Arrabal, 1971), *L'Arbre de Guernica* (Arrabal, 1975), *La caza* (Saura, 1966) and *El jardín de las delicias* (Saura, 1970), Archibald examines the historiographical perspectives of these films and their makers, both in serving political needs and in their contribution to romanticized or partial representations of the war.

The following five chapters explore specific issues of representation since Franco's death; Basque nationalism and cyclical histories in *Vacas* (Medem, 1992); the use of comedy in

narrating the Civil War in *¡Ay Carmela!* (Saura, 1990), *Belle Époque* (Trueba, 1992), *La Vaquilla* (Berlanga, 1985) and *Libertarias* (Aranda, 1996); the importance of the ghost figure and the past in Mexican-born Guillermo del Toro's *El espinazo del diablo* (2001); the issue of inter-Republican conflict as represented in *Land and Freedom* (Loach, 1995) and finally *Soldados de Salamina* (Trueba, 2002) is investigated for the ways in which its content and form problematize notions of accessing the past in the ways initially discussed in the introduction, posited by Jenkins, Rosenstone and White.

The focus of his thesis is the value of fictional representations of the Civil War in cinema beyond their adherence to historical fact or theories of representation; this is exemplified in his reading of *For Whom the Bell Tolls* and *Five Cartridges*, in which inherent value exists in the works, in spite of the obvious vested interests of the American and Soviet perspectives that pervade the narratives. In the discussion of [AQ1] *Soldiers of Salamis*, Archibald presents a persuasive argument about the complexities of representing memory or history in fictional film, by way of a conclusion of his study. Here Archibald goes beyond the ways in which other films discussed have served the national interests of their time and location into a discussion of the inherent difficulties of representing such a nuanced or labyrinthine concept as history. This chapter argues that the filmic forms encourage audiences to reconsider the past, demonstrated in *Soldados de Salamina* through the blurring of reality and fiction, enabling the film to open up the multitudinous interpretations of the past while remaining self-reflexive and juxtaposing 'mainstream cinema's desire – for heroic figures with war's mundane, deadly, often anonymous reality' (173) in which partial truths of the past still hold value in the present day.

The volume's title is not simply hyperbole; it speaks to the scale of the cinematic representation of the conflict and to the weariness with which some view such extensive production. Archibald argues that such reproduction is perhaps destined to continue, motivated by the social animosities that generated the conflict and continue to exist, and a continuing unease with an unsettled past as 'the battle for Spain's future is partially played out in the cinematically recreated battles of the past' (187). Although

the book does not break substantial ground in the readings of the individual films, their framing in their rightfully international context in a discussion that does not simply focus on Spanish production and politics is valuable in the scholarship of cinematic representations of the past.

IMOGEN BLOOMFIELD

University of Hull

MARÍA INÉS CISTERNA GOLD. *Exilio en el espacio literario argentino de la postdictadura*. 2013. London: Tamesis. 212 pp. ISBN: 9781855662575.

En *Exilio en el espacio literario argentino de la postdictadura*, María Inés Cisterna Gold analiza el tropos del exilio en cuatro libros publicados en la década del ochenta, libros que a su juicio no han tenido todavía el reconocimiento que merecen: *Vudú urbano* (1984) de Edgardo Cozarinsky, *Maldición eterna a quien lea estas páginas* (1980) de Manuel Puig, *Insomnio* (1986) de Marcelo Cohen, y *Composición de lugar* (1984) de Juan Martini.

Uno de los mayores aciertos de este estudio es haber considerado el exilio no solo como expatriación o destierro sino también como experiencia de anhelo, de desarraigo, de pérdida del origen, y espacio no tanto marginal sino común que el sujeto comparte con aquel que no coincide 'con las consignas ideológicas que lo gobiernan' (Saer).

De allí que el tropos del exilio no sea trabajado únicamente como tema en los textos mencionados, sino también como lugar de resistencia simbólica y, aún más interesante, como categoría crítica. A su vez la autora pone a dialogar este tropos con otros motivos recurrentes en la literatura argentina como el de la ciudad (lugar nostálgico por excelencia), el cuerpo y la subjetividad, el compromiso del escritor, y las tensiones del afuera y el adentro en la institución literaria. Cisterna Gold sugiere que si bien la excepcionalidad de la experiencia dictatorial justifica la ejemplaridad de este corpus, la literatura de exilio no es tanto una escritura particular de esa época como un espacio fundacional (y fundante) de la literatura nacional.

En este sentido, el libro desnaturaliza la noción de 'literatura de exilio' para correrla de los rígidos márgenes impuestos por cierta crítica al referirse con ese mote únicamente

a la literatura sobre el terrorismo de Estado y acercarla a los textos de los Padres de la literatura argentina. Se trata, en definitiva, 'de abrir la idea de exilio a contextos y geografías mucho más amplias y que impliquen nuevas formas de pensar el nacionalismo literario y el lugar del autor en esas coyunturas' (6).

Así, el primer capítulo invita a revisar el *Facundo* de Domingo Faustino Sarmiento o el *Martín Fierro* de José Hernández, libros-archivo de los textos de su corpus, junto con los cuales forman lo que la autora llama una 'tropología del exilio' o 'genealogía del destierro'. En todos los casos 'el tema central de los textos seleccionados es la experiencia del exilio como acto de lectura, como material que posibilita una mirada crítica frente a la literatura a la que pertenecen' (6). El desplazamiento físico de los autores de estos textos, involuntariamente alejados de su tierra natal, produce una dislocación en los cánones literarios, una forma de repensar la escritura y su relación con conceptos como identidad y nación.

El segundo capítulo analiza los relatos de Cozarinsky y Martini a partir de la idea de 'comienzo' que Edward Said concibe no como lugar inamovible sino como escritura crítica y alternativa al lugar de origen. En estos relatos la experiencia del exilio es convertida en metáfora de nostalgia y 'entendida como manifestación del deseo de regreso a una comunidad' (58).

En el tercer capítulo la autora recurre a la idea de hospitalidad de Jacques Derrida, y a los derechos condicionales del huésped que es protegido por el país anfitrión siempre y cuando respete ciertos códigos y pactos (por ejemplo, la duración de su estadía). Para Cisterna Gold, esta paradoja de quien es acogido y al mismo tiempo mantenido a cierta distancia representa la imposibilidad de una bienvenida incondicional en el exilio. En este capítulo, a mi entender uno de los más interesantes del libro, se desafía la idea generalizada de la lengua como hábitat de identidad y se la entiende, en palabras de Roberto Espósito, antes como 'una grieta que impide un espacio común absoluto' (82).

Finalmente, el cuarto capítulo se detiene en las novelas de Cohen, Puig y Martini a partir del vínculo entre el exilio, testimonio, autobiografía e intervención política.

Exilio en el espacio literario argentino de la postdictadura es un escrito de riguroso espíritu

crítico, producto de la investigación doctoral que su autora llevó a cabo en la New York University. Se trata, en suma, de una contribución comprometida al creciente campo de los estudios de memoria en América latina e incluso, por qué no, a los estudios de literatura de viaje y de exilio referidos a otras latitudes y contextos históricos.

JORDANA BLEJMAR

University of London

ERICA CUSI WORTHAM, *Indigenous Media in Mexico: Culture, Community and the State*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press. 2013. xviii + 265 pp. ISBN 978-0-8223-5500-7 (pbk), ISBN 978-0-8223-5484-0 (hbk).

This volume presents the reader with a detailed ethnographic study of various indigenous media initiatives in the states of Oaxaca and Chiapas, based on extensive fieldwork conducted by the author at the beginning of the new millennium and substantial ongoing contact with the mediamakers concerned both before and after that point. The introduction makes clear the author's position and lays out a framework for her conceptualization of indigenous media as not something that reveals a recognizable aesthetic or 'other way of seeing', but as a socially embedded process of 'making culture visible' and as a resistant 'postura'. Thus the main focus of the book is on the social and political processes underlying the creation and circulation of indigenous media rather than on analysis of specific documentaries or other products. The remainder of the book is divided into three parts, with two chapters apiece.

Part I contextualizes Cusi Wortham's research by exploring the international and national contexts of indigenous media, slowly zooming in on the Mexican Instituto Nacional Indígena's 'video indígena' project as it evolved through the late 1980s and 1990s. The author is particularly attentive to the tensions inherent in the roll-out of a state-run, if maverick-led, programme to 'teach' audiovisual media to indigenous peoples and the complex community settings into which it was thrust. In essence, she describes the full trajectory of the 'video indígena' project to the point where actors in the field move beyond the limitations of its 'indigenizing' discourse, choosing to identify their work

with terms such as 'comunicación alternativa' and 'comunicación de lucha' instead.

Part II moves on to consider first a selection of initiatives in Oaxaca that were either directly the result of the INI project, emerged in resistance to it, and/or possibly helped to inspire it in the first place. The section explores in particular the power dynamics that subtend all such initiatives, both in terms of relationships between indigenous communities and the state and within/between indigenous communities themselves. It then offers a detailed case study of the trajectory of Radio y Video Tamix in Tamazulapam del Espíritu Santo, in the Mixe highland region of Oaxaca, arguing that, although constituted by indigenous members, the group were not sufficiently embedded in community political structures to succeed in the long term.

Part III contrasts the Oaxacan case studies and their limitations with a chapter on the closely related Chiapas Media Project/Promedios that came about after the 1994 Zapatista uprising and that has arguably been more successful given its more overtly political objectives in support of the broader Zapatista cause and its emphasis on representing cultures of resistance rather than of individual indigenous groups. Finally, Part III includes the conclusion to the book as a whole which considers the issue of the international circulation of some of the products of the initiatives studied and problematizes the too easily accepted assumptions about embeddedness, authenticity and representativity that such cultural products are seen to have when screened beyond the confines of their communities of origin.

There is much to applaud in this volume: the painstaking presentation of ethnographic research and the thoroughgoing problematization of key issues in our conceptualization of indigenous media are valuable contributions to the field. However, the title is somewhat misleading: 'Indigenous Media in Mexico' leads one to expect a far wider panoramic approach with case studies representing a good geographical and cultural spread across the contemporary nation-state. 'Indigenous Media in Southern Mexico', or 'Indigenous Media in Oaxaca' would have been rather more accurate. Nevertheless, Cusi Wortham is undoubtedly victim to the same currents that she notes indigenous mediamakers suffer when screening their

work in international contexts: the nation-state is the label under which indigenous films find international audiences and under which academic books such as this find their readership. My more substantive criticism is that the book is poorly edited. There are more typos in this book than I have ever found in any other published academic work: there are problems with syntax; with missing accents on Spanish words, or accents supplied sometimes but not others; the use of italics for Spanish words is sporadic; some Mexican place names are misspelt and there are irritating inconsistencies with the way in which the author refers to key figures such as Mexican presidents with either their first or second surname interchangeably, cf. the 'Salinas administration' (28), or the 'Gortari administration' (28). And finally there are references to very interesting works that then are simply not in the bibliography. I cannot believe that this book was ever properly proofread and that reflects badly on both the author and the prestigious university press that has published this work. This really is a pity, since this degree of sloppiness in presentation goes a long way to eroding the confidence that one would otherwise have in the author based on her extensive fieldwork and compelling conceptual grasp of the material studied.

THEA PITMAN

University of Leeds

MICHAEL REID, *Brazil. The Troubled Rise of a Global Power*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press. 2014. 334 pp. ISBN: 978-0300165609.

NINA SCHNEIDER, *Brazilian Propaganda. Legitimizing an Authoritarian Regime*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida. 2014. 213 pp. ISBN: 978-0813049908.

For much of the last century Brazil remained a 'sleeping giant' seemingly destined never to realize its economic and political potential and become an emerging world power. Belatedly and after many false dawns, a transformation eventually took place that received formal recognition internationally when Brazil was chosen to host the World Cup in 2014 followed by the Olympic Games in 2016. The first of two books under review provides a timely overview of Brazil's impressive

recent progress and the second looks back at a darker era by focusing on official and unofficial propaganda under the military dictatorship that governed the country between 1964 and 1985.

Michael Reid, *The Economist's* former Latin America editor, is well qualified to guide us through Brazil's recent history and along the way offers lively insights and analyses. Each chapter is a gem of succinct, evidence-based analysis where thought-provoking critique is combined with suggestions for remedial action. He identifies the deep-seated problems (uncompetitive manufacturing, insufficient infrastructure investment, a patronage system coupled with widespread corruption, stark income disparities, among many others). Recent progress has been based on new energy sources, commodity prices and, encouragingly, science and research but, as the subtitle implies, the journey has been far from easy and much still remains to be done. Always highly readable, Reid is equally at ease when writing about politics, economics, social change and constitutional issues. He deals with controversial topics deftly and in a balanced way but does not pull his punches when he sees fit.

The early chapters locate Brazil in its socio-historical setting by covering diverse topics, including the Portuguese colonial legacy, the controversial ideas of Gilberto Freyre and contemporary cultural phenomena such as the telenovelas. Reid then moves on to the factors that explain the country's recent success: the discovery of large oil reserves, the commodity boom and the rise of agribusiness, the effective management of the economy during the presidencies of Fernando Enrique Cardoso and Lula Da Silva, the millions of people lifted out of poverty and Brazil's emergence on the world stage as a member of the BRICS group. On the other hand, the optimism has to be tempered by the knowledge that demand for Brazil's exports is cooling and savings rates and productivity levels remain stubbornly low. Reid warns against the drift away from the social-democratic consensus that characterized the successful era between 1994 and 2006 and warns against a return to the corporatist and dirigiste 'national developmentalist' state. He is scathing about the corruption, bribery and nepotism that is endemic in Brazil and politicians who have 'the hide of an alli-

gator' and 'a deep-rooted sense of entitlement and a tradition of impunity'. Lula, who left office even more popular than when he entered, is lauded for demonstrating to the rest of Latin America that societal change and reductions in inequality can go hand in hand with democracy and economic growth. Yet the 2014 election that saw the re-election of Lula's successor, Dilma Rousseff, after a close-fought campaign, raised fears that the consensus is breaking down and old divisions are reappearing.

The author is cautious with regard to the likelihood that his suggested reforms will be adopted. He identifies the need to increase the level of domestic savings and investment and implement social security, labour and fiscal reforms together with allocating more resources to education, science and technology and the pursuit of environmentally friendly development. The challenge for Dilma is that the people are demanding greater political accountability and better public services at a time when the economy is slowing down and the cost of living, pension costs and crime levels are rising.

Schneider's short book, published in the year that marks the fiftieth anniversary of the military coup, contributes to the

growing pool of research on the dictatorship and seeks to 'kick-start a debate on civil collaboration'. Her perspective is informed by her upbringing and education as a post-Nazi German wishing to understand why this type of regime flourishes in some societies. To this end, she examines propaganda, a common element to the repressive regimes in both Germany and Brazil. In so doing, she explains how the military rulers collaborated with civilian allies, chiefly business and media interests, to legitimize themselves by producing propaganda that ranged across the spectrum from aggressive to subliminal. Schneider pays particular attention to film, including the shorts made by the AERP and ARP (state propaganda agencies) that sought to legitimize the regime by propagating the 'miracle myth' and disseminating the notion that Brazil was a society without class or racial conflicts. Utilizing an impressive range of sources, Schneider's study makes an important contribution to widening our understanding of what she calls the 'civilian-military regime' as it attempted to project an appearance of democracy, disguise its internal factionalism and control cultural life.

DAVID CORKILL

University of Chester